

## WORK SESSION AGENDA

**CITY COUNCIL WORK SESSION  
TUESDAY  
NOVEMBER 8, 2016**

**COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
211 WEST ASPEN AVENUE  
4:00 ~~6:00~~ P.M.**

**1. Call to Order**

**NOTICE OF OPTION TO RECESS INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION**

*Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the City Council and to the general public that, at this work session, the City Council may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).*

**2. Pledge of Allegiance**

**3. Roll Call**

*NOTE: One or more Councilmembers may be in attendance telephonically or by other technological means.*

MAYOR NABOURS  
VICE MAYOR BAROTZ  
COUNCILMEMBER BREWSTER  
COUNCILMEMBER EVANS

COUNCILMEMBER ORAVITS  
COUNCILMEMBER OVERTON  
COUNCILMEMBER PUTZOVA

**4. Preliminary Review of Draft Agenda for the November 15, 2016, City Council Meeting.\***

*\* Public comment on draft agenda items may be taken under "Review of Draft Agenda Items" later in the meeting, at the discretion of the Mayor. Citizens wishing to speak on agenda items not specifically called out by the City Council for discussion under the second Review section may submit a speaker card for their items of interest to the recording clerk.*

**5. Public Participation**

*Public Participation enables the public to address the council about items that are not on the prepared agenda. Public Participation appears on the agenda twice, at the beginning and at the end of the work session. You may speak at one or the other, but not both. Anyone wishing to comment at the meeting is asked to fill out a speaker card and submit it to the recording clerk. When the item comes up on the agenda, your name will be called. You may address the Council up to three times throughout the meeting, including comments made during Public Participation. Please limit your remarks to three minutes per item to allow everyone to have an opportunity to speak. At the discretion of the Chair, ten or more persons present at the meeting and wishing to speak may appoint a representative who may have no more than fifteen minutes to speak.*

6. **Discussion of the Rethink Recycling Action Plan.**
7. **Discussion of Property Donation to the Arizona Department of Veterans' Services for the Purpose of a Veterans' Facility. *SEE ITEM #15-A ON THE NOVEMBER 15, 2016, DRAFT AGENDA.***
8. **Review of Draft Agenda Items for the November 15, 2016, City Council Meeting.\***  
*\* Public comment on draft agenda items will be taken at this time, at the discretion of the Mayor.*
9. **Public Participation**
10. **Informational Items To/From Mayor, Council, and City Manager; future agenda item requests.**
11. **Adjournment**

CERTIFICATE OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on \_\_\_\_\_, at \_\_\_\_\_ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the City Council with the City Clerk.

Dated this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2016.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Elizabeth A. Burke, MMC, City Clerk

## CITY OF FLAGSTAFF

### STAFF SUMMARY REPORT

**To:** The Honorable Mayor and Council  
**From:** McKenzie Jones, Sustainability Specialist  
**Date:** 10/28/2016  
**Meeting Date:** 11/08/2016



#### TITLE:

**Discussion of the Rethink Recycling Action Plan.**

#### DESIRED OUTCOME:

To update City Council on staff's existing and planned efforts to promote waste prevention and recycling throughout the Flagstaff community.

#### EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:

In order to effectively use financial resources dedicated to improving recycling rates in Flagstaff, Sustainability and Solid Waste staff have developed the Rethink Recycling Action Plan. The Rethink Recycling Action Plan outlines barriers to effective recycling and guides City staff in implementing the most cost-effective initiatives that will empower the community to be resourceful, reduce waste, and make recycling more efficient.

#### INFORMATION:

##### COUNCIL GOALS:

- 3) Provide sustainable and equitable public facilities, services, and infrastructure systems in an efficient and effective manner to serve all population areas and demographics
- 7) Continue to implement the Flagstaff Regional Plan and focus efforts on specific plans
- 8) Improve effectiveness of notification, communication, and engagement with residents, neighborhoods and businesses and about City services, programs, policies, projects and developments
- 9) Improve the economic quality of life for Flagstaff through economic diversification, and by fostering jobs and programs that grow wages and revenues
- 10) Support and assist the most vulnerable

##### REGIONAL PLAN:

Policy E&C.1.4. Maintain air quality through pursuit of non-polluting industry and commercial enterprises.

Policy E&C.2.1. Encourage the reduction of all energy consumption, especially fossil-fuel generated energy, in public, commercial, industrial, and residential sectors.

Policy E.1.3. Empower all community members to make smarter energy choices through education and incentives.

Goals CD.1. Improve the City and County financial systems to provide for needed infrastructure development and rehabilitation, including maintenance and enhancement of existing infrastructure.

Goal PF.2. Provide sustainable and equitable public facilities, services, and infrastructure systems in an efficient and effective manner to serve all population areas and demographics.

**Attachments:** [Rethink Recycling Action Plan](#)



# RETHINK RECYCLING

FY 2017 – FY 2019 Action Plan

## CURRENT WASTE CONDITIONS IN FLAGSTAFF

In 2015, more than 110,000 tons of material were collected by City of Flagstaff residential and commercial collection programs. This includes wood waste, green waste, paper sludge and hazardous waste collection. 20% of residential waste was recycled and 9.9% of commercial waste was recycled. A system-wide diversion rate is also calculated, which is much higher at 49%. The City does not currently have access to diversion rates by sector.

Sector	Recycling Rate	Diversion Rate
Single-family residential	20.23%	
Commercial/ Multifamily residential	9.91%	
Community wide	13.76%	49.05%
National average	34%	

While it paints a somewhat promising picture for Flagstaff's waste conditions, this last figure is potentially misleading. This diversion rate, calculated using Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) guidelines, includes significant amounts of wood waste, green waste, and paper sludge, which are currently being used as an alternative daily cover at the landfill. Because these materials replace new material that would have to be added to serve this purpose, they are considered to be diverted. When we do achieve a zero waste future, wood waste, green waste, and paper sludge will have to be diverted through some other means. As a result, there should be discussion related to the measurement of waste diversion and when it is appropriate to exclude these materials from those considered diverted.

Based on 2014 data and current waste conditions, the Cinder Lake Landfill engineers project the landfill to close by 2054. If Flagstaff continues to recycle and produce waste at the current rate, the City will need to site and construct a new landfill, a socially, economically, and environmentally impactful process.

The Action Plan addresses many of the unique challenges faced by Flagstaff's recycling and waste prevention programming, but the City is also reacting to the current state of the recycling industry, which is experiencing rapid change and hardship due to multiple factors. So, in addition to a need to change in order to achieve the goals outlined in the Action Plan, the City will also need to rethink its current financial model in order for the program to be financially sustainable in this new recycling landscape.

## EXISTING RECYCLING AND WASTE PREVENTION PROGRAMS

The City currently sponsors multiple waste reduction programs including:

- First Friday recycling center tours at Norton Environmental
- New utility customer recycling outreach
- Residential green waste collection

- MyWaste Recycling App and web platform
- Residential and commercial glass collection and recycling program
- Household food waste prevention programming
- Individual outreach to 2,000 community members per year at community events
- Biannual Fix-it Clinic events
- Biannual Drop-off Day events
- Christmas Tree Recycling

## HOW THE ACTION PLAN WILL BE USED

The Action Plan outlines the strategies the City will pursue over the next three years based on current waste reduction needs and funding available.

## ISSUES AND CHALLENGES BY SECTOR

### Commercial Sector

It is clear that barriers exist to implementing recycling in businesses, they include:

- Inconsistent and confusing coloring of recycling and trash dumpsters. While green has been adopted as the color to represent recycling and is relatively consistent, trash dumpsters are often brown or blue, which is actually the internationally accepted color for recycling.
- Businesses and multi-family property managers must initiate and pay for additional services, unlike the single-family residential sector where services can be included with trash collection service.
- Unless a business is able to reduce its level of trash service, these costs are additive.
- There is a landlord/tenant split incentive, where an owner or property management company pays the trash bills and may be unwilling to subscribe to additional services requested by businesses.
- Trash and recycling containers in common collection areas often suffer from “the tragedy of the commons,” and contamination is an issue.
- Many businesses report illegal dumping as a significant concern, especially if they are to be required to add recycling or compost collection service.
- There is often insufficient space for additional carts or dumpsters, especially in dense commercial districts.
- There is a general lack of awareness that implementing recycling at a business has the potential to reduce costs over featuring only trash service.
- There is currently no mechanism for the City to require private trash haulers to report their annual tonnage.
- There is currently no mechanism for the City to require that private haulers offer recycling services to all commercial customers.

### Single-Family Residential

This sector has access to curbside recycling service from the City and compost through for-profit entities. While this has resulted in greater diversion rates than other sectors, waste sorts reveal that

there are gains to be made from the recyclable materials still present in the trash. The main barrier to greater diversion is persistent confusion over what materials are recyclable and compostable. Single-family residents would benefit from a more intense focus on:

- Clarity around recycling guidelines.
- Facilities that accept hard-to-recycle and hazardous materials.
- Reduce and reuse opportunities.
- Expanding the relationship between waste haulers and residents.

### Multifamily Residential

In most cities, the multifamily housing sector has the lowest diversion rate due to barriers including the high resident turnover, inadequate recycling containers on site and limited education received by residents since many do not interact with their waste hauler. Much like the commercial sector, multifamily property managers and residents suffer from inconsistent and confusing coloring of recycling and trash dumpsters.

In multifamily housing complexes issues with improper recyclable sorting (contamination) are more common in comparison to single-family homes and property owners report a significant problem with illegal dumping. The fact that property owners or managers are often not onsite is also a barrier.

This customer class was recently opened up to private haulers, which has created its own set of challenges. For example, haulers might not use City facilities for disposing of collected waste, making it difficult to accurately estimate waste generation and diversion within the City. Haulers are not required to report on tonnage of materials collected. Private haulers are also not be required to offer recycling services, preventing a customer from diverting any of their waste.

### City Operations

Goals for waste within municipal operations have already been established in the Municipal Sustainability Plan, including: reducing paper consumption, promoting recycling awareness and participation, and increasing the recycling recovery rate. Waste prevention and recycling within the City has improved in recent years due to employee education programs, such as “office makeovers” and presentations during new employee orientation that empower employees to reduce the amount of waste they produce and recycle correctly. Not all City employees have been reached with this education, so there is still room to improve.

The recycling rate at five of the most utilized City facilities was 74% in 2015. The contamination rate at these same facilities was 19%. While this represents a good starting point, but 21% of items placed in the trash were recyclable and should be improved upon in the future. The Municipal Sustainability Plan establishes a target of 100% recovery of recyclables and a 0% contamination rate moving forward.

### FY 2017 WORK PLAN ITEMS

- Implement city-wide recycling education in K-12 classrooms.

- Partner with Willow Bend Environmental Education Center to offer recycling and waste prevention outreach to all 1<sup>st</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> grade students in Flagstaff.
- Provide students with take-home materials with the necessary info to recycle properly and reduce material consumption.
- Begin city-wide re-coloring and re-binning.
  - All new bins and dumpsters will adhere to a color scheme of blue for recycling material and charcoal grey for landfill material.
  - To avoid confusion during this potentially lengthy time period of replacement and re-painting, new colors will be implemented strategically by neighborhood with targeted outreach complementing the process.
- Expand public outreach to promote greater understanding of recycling in Flagstaff.
  - Launch wide spread marketing campaign including radio, print, transit, social media, and City Solid Waste vehicle advertising.
  - This will include building relationships between Solid Waste drivers and City residents by equipping drivers with outreach materials to evaluate and improve sorting habits of individual residents.
- Continue Food: Too Good to Waste pilot project that aims to reduce household food waste in Flagstaff.
  - Expand target audiences to include City employees and families in Flagstaff.
- Launch a new public outreach volunteer program called “Master Recycler”.
  - Develop program materials and plan for a pilot program with the goal of educating 20 to 30 Flagstaff residents on outreach related to recycling and waste prevention.
  - Utilize volunteers to provide outreach at opportunities, such as tabling at popular events and presenting at community gatherings.
- Conduct a targeted pilot project multifamily at a small number of complexes.
  - Create a strategy for a cost-effective and efficient approach to providing zero waste education and assistance to the broader multifamily community.
  - Gather data and research the existing multifamily complexes to inform and prioritize outreach efforts.
- Expand water bottle refill station infrastructure in City facilities.
- Roll out new public space recycling bins throughout downtown Flagstaff.
- Begin biannual and quarterly waste audits (conducted by Solid Waste).
  - Targeted audits will help evaluate the success of programming by identifying how specific neighborhoods are responding to programming and if certain items need a greater focus in outreach materials, programs, and services.
- Review existing financial considerations.
  - Current and future costs of recycling based on the current model.
- Expand recycling in City parks and downtown public spaces.

#### FY 2018 WORK PLAN ITEMS

- Complete a study to determine the range of values that pertain to a cubic yard of landfill space.

- Create a multifamily customer class in solid waste collection data to adequately evaluate multifamily residential services.
- Continue Master Recycler Program with a new class of volunteers.
- Expand outreach and implement necessary regulation to promote greater recycling rates for commercial and multifamily classes.
- Develop a plan for dealing with the potential nonrenewal of the contract with Norton Environmental in September 2018. The final contract period ends in September 2023.
- Evaluate multifamily recycling pilot and develop a city-wide multifamily residential assistance program based on findings.
- Expand community-wide educational efforts on available services, incentives, and facilities as well as proper recycling/composting/source reduction methods.
- Improve public event recycling policies, resources, and infrastructure.
- Explore potential support of on-site composting, including expanding workshop series and implementing a rebate program for compost bins.

#### FY 2019 WORK PLAN ITEMS

- Evaluate Food: Too Good to Waste pilot and develop a plan for scaling up the program.
- Explore legislation that enables commercial and multifamily properties to implement a successful recycling program.
  - Provide edits to the zoning code that require adequate space for recycling dumpsters and service trucks.
- Explore legislation that would require data reporting by private haulers to accurately determine city waste generation and diversion figures.
- Launch a study to determine the range of economic values pertaining to the amount of remaining landfill space.
- Explore new markets, looking for buyers of still unrecyclable materials like carpet, rubber, gypsum, inert materials and mattresses.
- Explore organics composting opportunities within the community.